In the United States Court of Federal Claims

OFFICE OF SPECIAL MASTERS
No. 19-1759V
UNPUBLISHED

ESTHER RUBINSON, Petitioner, v. SECRETARY OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES, Respondent.	Chief Special Master Corcoran Filed: September 22, 2021 Special Processing Unit (SPU); Joint Stipulation on Damages; Influenza (Flu) Vaccine; Shoulder Injury Related to Vaccine Administration (SIRVA)

Bridget Candace McCullough, Muller Brazil, LLP, Dresher, PA, for Petitioner.

Wei Kit Tai, U.S. Department of Justice, Washington, DC, for Respondent.

DECISION ON JOINT STIPULATION[1]

On November 14, 2019, Esther Rubinson filed a petition for compensation under the National Vaccine Injury Compensation Program, 42 U.S.C. §300aa-10, *et seq.*[2] (the "Vaccine Act"). Petitioner alleges that she suffered a right shoulder injury related to vaccine administration ("SIRVA") as a result of being administered an influenza ("flu") vaccine to her right shoulder on January 23, 2018. Petition at Preamble; Stipulation, filed at September 21, 2021, ¶¶ 2, 4. Petitioner further alleges that her injuries lasted for more than six months. Petition at 4; Stipulation at ¶ 4. Respondent denies that "petitioner sustained a Table SIRVA within the timeframe set forth in the Table; and denies that the flu immunization caused petitioner's alleged shoulder injury and/or any other injury." Stipulation at ¶ 6.

Nevertheless, on September 21, 2021, the parties filed the attached joint stipulation, stating that a decision should be entered awarding compensation. I find the

[1] Because this unpublished Decision contains a reasoned explanation for the action in this case, I am required to post it on the United States Court of Federal Claims' website in accordance with the E-Government Act of 2002. 44 U.S.C. § 3501 note (2012) (Federal Management and Promotion of Electronic Government Services). **This means the Decision will be available to anyone with access to the internet.** In accordance with Vaccine Rule 18(b), Petitioner has 14 days to identify and move to redact medical or other information, the disclosure of which would constitute an unwarranted invasion of privacy. If, upon review, I agree that the identified material fits within this definition, I will redact such material from public access.

[2] National Childhood Vaccine Injury Act of 1986, Pub. L. No. 99-660, 100 Stat. 3755. Hereinafter, for ease of citation, all section references to the Vaccine Act will be to the pertinent subparagraph of 42 U.S.C. § 300aa (2012).

stipulation reasonable and adopt it as my decision awarding damages, on the terms set forth therein.

Pursuant to the terms stated in the attached Stipulation, **I award** the following compensation:

> **A lump sum of $65,000.00, in the form of a check payable to Petitioner**. Stipulation at ¶ 8. This amount represents compensation for all items of damages that would be available under Section 15(a). *Id*.

I approve the requested amount for Petitioner's compensation. In the absence of a motion for review filed pursuant to RCFC Appendix B, the clerk of the court is directed to enter judgment in accordance with this decision.[3]

IT IS SO ORDERED.

s/Brian H. Corcoran
Brian H. Corcoran
Chief Special Master

[3] Pursuant to Vaccine Rule 11(a), entry of judgment can be expedited by the parties' joint filing of notice renouncing the right to seek review.

THE UNITED STATES COURT OF FEDERAL CLAIMS
OFFICE OF SPECIAL MASTERS

ESTHER RUBINSON, Petitioner, v. SECRETARY OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES, Respondent.	No. 19-1759V Chief Special Master Corcoran ECF

STIPULATION

The parties hereby stipulate to the following matters:

1. Esther Rubinson ("petitioner") filed a petition for vaccine compensation under the National Vaccine Injury Compensation Program, 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-10 to -34 (the "Vaccine Program"). The petition seeks compensation for injuries allegedly related to petitioner's receipt of an influenza ("flu") vaccine, which vaccine is contained in the Vaccine Injury Table (the "Table"), 42 C.F.R. § 100.3(a).

2. Petitioner received a flu vaccine on January 23, 2018, in her right deltoid.

3. The vaccine was administered within the United States.

4. Petitioner alleges that she sustained a right-sided shoulder injury related to vaccine administration ("SIRVA") within the time period set forth in the Table, or in the alternative, that her alleged shoulder injury was caused by the vaccine. She further alleges that she experienced residual effects of this alleged injury for more than six months.

5. Petitioner represents that there has been no prior award or settlement of a civil action for damages as a result of her condition.

6. Respondent denies that petitioner sustained a Table SIRVA within the timeframe set forth in the Table; and denies that the flu immunization caused petitioner's alleged shoulder injury and/or any other injury.

7. Maintaining their above-stated positions, the parties nevertheless now agree that the issues between them shall be settled and that a decision should be entered awarding the compensation described in paragraph 8 of this Stipulation.

8. As soon as practicable after an entry of judgment reflecting a decision consistent with the terms of this Stipulation, and after petitioner has filed an election to receive compensation pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-21(a)(1), the Secretary of Health and Human Services will issue the following vaccine compensation payment:

> A lump sum of **$65,000.00** in the form of a check payable to petitioner. This amount represents compensation for all damages that would be available under 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-15(a) for injuries allegedly related to petitioner's receipt of the flu vaccine.

9. As soon as practicable after the entry of judgment on entitlement in this case, and after petitioner has filed both a proper and timely election to receive compensation pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-21(a)(1), and an application, the parties will submit to further proceedings before the special master to award reasonable attorneys' fees and costs incurred in proceeding upon this petition.

10. Petitioner and her attorney represent that they have identified to respondent all known sources of payment for items or services for which the Program is not primarily liable under 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-15(g), including State compensation programs, insurance policies, Federal or State health benefits programs (other than Title XIX of the Social Security Act (42 U.S.C. § 1396 et seq.)), or entities that provide health services on a pre-paid basis.

11. Payment made pursuant to paragraph 8 and any amounts awarded pursuant to paragraph 9 of this Stipulation will be made in accordance with 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-15(i), subject to the availability of sufficient statutory funds.

12. The parties and their attorneys further agree and stipulate that, except for any award for attorneys' fees and litigation costs, and past unreimbursable expenses, the money provided pursuant to this Stipulation will be used solely for the benefit of petitioner as contemplated by a strict construction of 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-15(a) and (d), and subject to the conditions of 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-15(g) and (h).

13. In return for the payments described in paragraphs 8 and 9, petitioner, in her individual capacity and on behalf of her heirs, executors, administrators, successors and/or assigns, does forever irrevocably and unconditionally release, acquit and discharge the United States and the Secretary of Health and Human Services from any and all actions or causes of action (including agreements, judgments, claims, damages, loss of services, expenses and all demands of whatever kind or nature) that have been brought, could have been brought, or could be timely brought in the Court of Federal Claims, under the National Vaccine Injury Compensation Program, 42 U.S.C. § 300aa-10 et seq., on account of, or in any way growing out of, any and all known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected personal injuries to or death of petitioner resulting from, or alleged to have resulted from, the flu vaccination administered on or about January 23, 2018, as alleged by petitioner in a petition for vaccine compensation filed on November 14, 2019, in the United States Court of Federal Claims as petition No. 19-1759V.

14. If petitioner should die prior to entry of judgment, this agreement shall be voidable upon proper notice to the Court on behalf of either or both of the parties.

15. If the special master fails to issue a decision in complete conformity with the terms of this Stipulation or if the Court of Federal Claims fails to enter judgment in conformity with a decision that is in complete conformity with the terms of this Stipulation, then the parties' settlement and this Stipulation shall be voidable at the sole discretion of either party.

16. This Stipulation expresses a full and complete negotiated settlement of liability and damages claimed under the National Childhood Vaccine Injury Act of 1986, as amended, except as otherwise noted in paragraph 9 above. There is absolutely no agreement on the part of the parties hereto to make any payment or to do any act or thing other than is herein expressly stated and clearly agreed to. The parties further agree and understand that the award described in this Stipulation may reflect a compromise of the parties' respective positions as to liability and/or amount of damages, and further, that a change in the nature of the injury or condition or in the items of compensation sought, is not grounds to modify or revise this agreement.

17. This Stipulation shall not be construed as an admission by the United States or the Secretary of Health and Human Services that the flu vaccine caused petitioner's alleged shoulder injury and/or any other injury.

18. All rights and obligations of petitioner hereunder shall apply equally to petitioner's heirs, executors, administrators, successors, and/or assigns.

END OF STIPULATION

/
/
/
/
/
/
/
/
/
/

Respectfully submitted,

PETITIONER:

ESTHER RUBINSON

ATTORNEY OF RECORD FOR PETITIONER:

BRIDGET MCCULLOUGH
Muller Brazil
715 Twining Road
Suite 208
Dresher, PA 19025
(215) 885-1655

AUTHORIZED REPRESENTATIVE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL:

HEATHER L. PEARLMAN
Deputy Director
Torts Branch
Civil Division
U.S. Department of Justice
P.O. Box 146
Benjamin Franklin Station
Washington, DC 20044-0146

AUTHORIZED REPRESENTATIVE OF THE SECRETARY OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES:

Dale Mishler, DHSc, for

TAMARA OVERBY
Acting Director, Division of Injury Compensation Programs (DICP)
Healthcare Systems Bureau
Health Resources and Services Administration
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services
5600 Fishers Lane, 08N146B
Rockville, MD 20857

ATTORNEY OF RECORD FOR RESPONDENT:

Wei Kit (Ricky) Tai
by Heather L Pearlman

WEI KIT (RICKY) TAI
Trial Attorney
Torts Branch
Civil Division
U.S. Department of Justice
P.O. Box 146
Benjamin Franklin Station
Washington, DC 20044-0146
(202) 616-9847
Wei.Tai@usdoj.gov

Dated: 09/21/2021